Radiocarbon Variability in the Western North Atlantic During the Last Deglaciation

Laura F. Robinson, Jess F. Adkins, Lloyd D. Keigwin, John Southon, Diego P. Fernandez, S-L Wang, Daniel S. Scheirer

We present a detailed history of glacial to Holocene radiocarbon in the deep western North Atlantic from deep-sea corals and paired benthic-planktonic foraminifera. The deglaciation is marked by switches between radiocarbon-enriched and -depleted waters, leading to large radiocarbon gradients in the water column. These changes played an important role in modulating atmospheric radiocarbon. The deep-ocean record supports the notion of a bipolar seesaw with increased Northern-source deep-water formation linked to Northern Hemisphere warming and the reverse. In contrast, the more frequent radiocarbon variations in the intermediate/deep ocean are associated with roughly synchronous changes at the poles.

The last deglaciation was punctuated by numerous distinct millennial-scale climate events (1, 2), and understanding the mechanisms behind these changes is a major goal of paleoceanography. The deep ocean stores and transports heat and carbon, so changes in its circulation are likely to influence global climate. Indeed, alternating the main site of deepwater formation between the Northern and Southern hemispheres has been linked to switches in the amount of cross-equatorial heat transport (3). This bipolar seesaw predicts sizable changes in mass transport in the deep North Atlantic and may be the cause of anti-phase warm and cool periods observed in Greenland and Antarctic ice cores during the last deglaciation (1, 2) (Fig. 1). Well-dated high-resolution records are needed to make a mechanistic connection between deep-ocean circulation and climate. Passive geochemical tracers from marine sediments show us that during the last glacial maximum (LGM), Northern-source water (NSW) overlay Southern-source water (SSW), with the boundary at ~2,000 m in the western North Atlantic (4, 5). The transition from the LGM to the modern state, where North Atlantic Deep Water (NADW) dominates the Western basin, was marked by a series of changes in the deep-ocean circulation pattern (6, 7). To help characterize those changes more completely, we have made 14C/12C measurements of well-dated samples of the deep-sea coral Desmophyllum dianthus (8).

A radiocarbon age can be deduced for a given water mass if its radiocarbon content (14C/12C) is known both when it forms and when it reaches the deep ocean. By making depth profiles of 14C in the past (9), we can investigate variability in deep-ocean 14C values and begin to put constraints on changes in ocean circulation. Deep-sea radiocarbon records can also be used to investigate the role of the ocean in modulating the atmospheric carbon reservoir. The ocean contains ~60 times as much carbon as the atmosphere, so small changes in uptake or release of radiocarbon from the ocean may cause large changes in atmospheric 14C. Today, radiocarbon-enriched NADW formation draws down atmospheric 14C more efficiently than radiocarbon-depleted Antarctic Bottom Water (AABW) formation, so varying the proportion of NSW to SSW or changing the flux of NSW are both likely to change atmospheric 14C. Our record of ocean 14C lets us constrain the influence of the deep ocean on atmospheric radiocarbon.

Fig. 1. The top three curves are observed atmospheric 14C records: Cariaco Basin in black (34), a Bahamas speleothem in gray (35), and Intcal04 in purple (39), which, during the main period of interest, is primarily based on precisely dated surface coral data (53). All of these records are in reasonable agreement from 10 ka back to ~15.5 ka, but there are differences during Heinrich 1. The age model for the Cariaco Basin is poorly constrained during Heinrich 1, with the exception of a distinct change in gray-scale that matches a δ18O event in both GISP2 and a U-Th dated speleothem from Hulu Cave (54) at 16.0 ka. Two outliers have been removed from the Cariaco record (16.10 ka and 17.96 ka). Between 26 and 22 ka, we plot only the Intcal04 (39) and speleothem data (35), which are consistent with one another. When comparing our ocean 14C data to the atmosphere, we refer to Intcal04 (39) except between 17.5 ka and 14.5 ka, where there are no surface coral data and the record is poorly constrained. In this 3000-year period, we combine the Cariaco (34) and speleothem records (35) as our best estimate of the atmosphere. The 10Be-based 14C (modeled) reconstruction is plotted on the same scale as the observed atmospheric record, with the maximum and minimum as thin lines and the mean as a thick red line (36). Arrows a to f and x to z point to times that are referred to in the text. The GISP2 (green) and Byrd δ18O (purple) records are plotted after Blunier and Brook (2).
Using radiocarbon as a circulation tracer has been successful in the modern ocean. NADW and AABW have end-member values of ~65% (per mil) and ~165%, respectively (10, 11). Radiocarbon decay causes deviations below the mixing line of these two end members, allowing us to calculate the radiocarbon age of the water in the North Atlantic (12). In the modern western North Atlantic [GEOSECS (Geophysical Ocean Section Study) Station 120, 33°16'N], the water column has a small vertical Δ14C gradient (~10%/1000 m) consistent with a single northern-source water mass (13). By contrast, farther south in the Atlantic, NADW is underlain by southern-sourced AABW. AABW has a characteristic low Δ14C because the “old” Pacific intermediate water from which it forms is not at the surface long enough to reequilibrate with the atmosphere. In the past, this approach is complicated by variability in the two end-member Δ14C values at the sites of deep-water formation (14). For example, increasing the extent of sea ice cover would allow less air-sea gas exchange and, therefore, less radiocarbon in AABW. Constraints on the past deep-ocean Δ14C have been acquired using the radiocarbon ages of benthic and planktonic foraminifera (BF-PF) and the aragonitic skeletons of deep-sea corals. In the foraminifera, the planktonic age can be converted to a calendar age, and the benthic 14C/12C ratio can then be used to calculate deep-ocean Δ14C. Early Δ14C reconstructions suffered from problems of species-dependent age variability in planktonic 14C/12C measurements (15–18), but this problem is alleviated by targeting depths with high foraminiferal abundances or high sedimentation rates (19).

Deep-sea corals, typically found at water depths of ~500 to 2500 m, are datable by U-Th techniques and are good archives of palaeo-Δ14C (20–24). Individual corals with different calendar ages can be compared with another to give a resolution similar to that of ocean sediment cores. The solitary coral *D. dianthus* is thought to have a life span of ~100 years (25), so each individual skeleton can be subsampled for 14C/12C to construct decadal-resolution records of radiocarbon variability, comparable to the temporal resolution of ice-core climate records (20). We collected more than 3700 *D. dianthus* corals from the New England Seamounts in May 2003 (26). U-Th isotopic measurements were made by isotope dilution, and 27 samples were selected for 14C/12C analysis (27) (table S1). Nine of these corals were subsampled to produce high-resolution transects of Δ14C. Our second sample set consists of 12 BF-PF pairs [spanning 19.5 thousand years ago (ka) to 10.7 ka] from the western North Atlantic and one additional sample using a benthic bivalve found in the core (table S2). Combining these data with published deep-sea corals and BF-PF pairs (19, 20, 28–32) allows us to reconstruct a detailed history of radiocarbon from the last glacial through to the Holocene.

**Discussion.** The 14C content of the atmosphere and the deep sea are coupled, but our knowledge of the history of these two reservoirs is vastly different. The history of radiocarbon variability in the atmosphere is reasonably well constrained through the LGM and beyond (33–35). Radiocarbon and 10Be are produced in the upper atmosphere simultaneously, and because 10Be is not subject to decay or uptake in the carbon cycle, it can be used as a proxy for the 14C production rate alone (36). Muscheler et al. (36) estimate the 10Be production rate from the measured 10Be content of Greenland ice cores and convert it to an expected atmospheric Δ14C record, assuming that the present-day carbon cycle was the same throughout (hereafter referred to as modeled atmospheric Δ14C (Fig. 1) (37, 38). Changes in observed atmospheric Δ14C that are greater than predicted from the production rate curve alone must be due to deviations from the assumed modern steady state, implying changes in the deep-ocean uptake on this 103- to 104-year time scale (34–36).

Compared with the atmosphere, our knowledge of the deep ocean is more limited, both in depth and in time. Our data fill this knowledge gap, allowing us to compare Δ14C at depth intervals in the western North Atlantic directly with the changes observed in the atmosphere (Fig. 2). A contour plot of the history of oceanic radiocarbon relative to atmospheric radiocarbon provides a true-age chronology through the glacial and deglacial periods (Fig. 3). It is clear from this plot that intermediate-deep (I/D) (1700 to 2500 m) waters are more variable than the abyss. A horizontal Δ14C divide separates water masses above and below ~2,500 m, and NSW penetrates below this divide only twice during the deglaciation. A deglacial,

**Fig. 2.** Raw Δ14C data for (A) 30.0 to 16.4 ka, (B) 16.4 to 15.1 ka, and (C) 15.1 to 10.0 ka, compartmentalized into seven depth bands: 1176 to 1221 m (red circles), 1381 to 1400 m (orange upside-down triangles), 1713 to 1790 m (black squares), 1886 to 2155 m (pale blue diamonds), 2228 to 2590 m (purple triangles), 2972 to 3845 m (blue crosses), and 4055 to 4712 m (green stars) below sea level. Each record is plotted against calendar age before the present (B.P.), with 2-SE error ellipses. Open symbols, crosses, and stars are BF-PF pairs; closed symbols are corals. One published Younger Dryas BF-PF data point (19) is not plotted because it lies above the atmospheric curve. In Fig. 2B, color-coded 2-SE calendar-age error bars are shown as horizontal bars, with error ellipses representing the relative error between individual points on the same coral. Solid lines join Δ14C measurements from within one coral; dashed lines connect data from separate corals. Two coral data points (1886 m, 16.1 ka and 2500 m, 15.9 ka) are not shown because they have large calendar-age errors that overlap other data points (242 and 297 years, respectively). The two points with large error ellipses that are shown are BF-PF pairs.
radiocarbon-depleted I/D water mass (akin to modern Antarctic Intermediate Water) is present at 40°N during Heinrich 1, the 15.4-ka event, and the Younger Dryas.

Glacial Ocean. From 28 to 17 ka, the \( \Delta^{14}C \) of the western North Atlantic is constrained by 12 points (11 BF-PF pairs and 1 coral) (Fig. 2A). The 25-ka coral at 1700 m has a \( \Delta^{14}C \) only 66% lower than the atmosphere, indicative of well-ventilated NSW. By contrast, all deeper samples are more depleted in radiocarbon than anywhere in the modern ocean. This depletion is \( >400\% \) at 28 ka and drops to \( \approx 230\% \) during the LGM (Fig. 2A, arrows a and b, and Fig. 4A). A slowdown in the ventilation rate or a change in the proportion of NSW to SSW may account for some of this observed \( \Delta^{14}C \) shift in the deep ocean. However, \( \text{Cd/Ca} \) ratios show us that the LGM deep North Atlantic was filled by SSW (6), and the pattern of deep-sea \( \Delta^{14}C \) from 21 to 18.7 ka reflects the atmosphere nearly synchronously, suggesting that this SSW water was circulating vigorously (39) (Fig. 2A). An alternative cause of radiocarbon depletion in the Southern Ocean is extensive sea-ice coverage, which would reduce the amount of the air-sea carbon exchange. In support of this mechanism, diatom-based reconstructions show that the LGM sea-ice extent was 5° farther north than in the present day and that before the LGM, the sea ice exhibited less seasonal variability (40–42). Over the same time period, from 30 ka to the LGM, the observed and modeled \( \Delta^{14}C \) of the atmospheric records converged from a large offset of \( >350\% \) to \( \approx 250\% \) (Fig. 1, arrows a and b). We suggest that the reduction in the atmospheric \( ^{14}C \) content was caused by an increase in the \( ^{14}C \) uptake in the Southern Ocean. Not only would such a change in the Southern Ocean affect the \( \Delta^{14}C \) of North Atlantic water but, as the dominant source to the deep Pacific, it could alter the whole ocean \( ^{14}C \) inventory.

Heinrich 1 and the 15.4-ka event. Heinrich events are characterized by massive ice-rafted debris (IRD) deposits in the North Atlantic (43), and it has been suggested that these large freshwater inputs in the Northern Hemisphere may reduce the rate of northern-sourced deep-water formation by lowering the density of surface water. The Pa/Th ratio of a marine sediment record from 4500 m at the Bermuda Rise shifts toward values indicative of such a reduction during Heinrich 1 (44). As expected, this slowdown in NSW flux is consistent with a reduction in the amount of uptake of \( ^{14}C \) by the deep Atlantic and a divergence in the modeled and observed atmospheric records (Fig. 1, arrow c), although the signal is not large.

During Heinrich 1, the \( \Delta^{14}C \) water-column profile is characterized by radiocarbon-rich water overlying radiocarbon-poor water (Fig. 4A), indicative of a greater proportion of SSW deeper in the water column. This deep water in the North Atlantic has the same offset from the atmosphere as the southern-source end member (\( \approx 265\% \)), constrained by a 16.7-ka deepsea coral from the Drake Passage (21), which implies a vigorous deep SSW circulation. These radiocarbon data are not consistent with the Bermuda Rise Pa/Th record (44) if the latter is interpreted as a dramatic reduction of deep-water ventilation rate. On the other hand, our data show the \( \Delta^{14}C \) of I/D water decreasing through Heinrich 1, consistent with a reduction in NSW flux (Fig. 2B). Six coral individuals describe a “U-shaped” change in \( \Delta^{14}C \) in the I/D ocean beginning at 16.3 ka (Fig. 2B, arrow x). Multiple measurements from within one coral at 2000 m define a \( \Delta^{14}C \) decrease of 50% over \( \approx 100 \) years (Fig. 2B). This decrease occurred faster than the rate of \( ^{14}C \) decay, so it must be due, at least in part, to mixing-in of low \( \Delta^{14}C \) SSW. This downward trend reverses at 16.2 ka, when multiple \( ^{14}C \) measurements within the same bed of SSW define a 30% rise in \( \Delta^{14}C \) caused by an increase in the influence of radiocarbon-rich NSW (Fig. 2B). The timing of the turn in the \( \Delta^{14}C \)-U-shape, 16.2 ka, is coincident with the start of the dramatic decrease in \( \Delta^{14}C \) observed in the atmosphere (within calendar-age error limits) and signals the end of Heinrich 1 at I/D depths.

After Heinrich 1, at 15.5 ka, all corals from 1700 to 2500 m have a \( \Delta^{14}C \) signal \( \approx 100\% \) lower than the atmosphere, indicative of a
The modeled and observed atmospheric Δ14C records converge after Heinrich 1. This convergence is interrupted by a plateau in the atmospheric Δ14C record that lasts from ~15.7 to 15.0 ka and is coincident with a pause in the deglacial temperature rise in both hemispheres (Fig. 1, arrow y). At water depths of 1700 to 2000 m, this 15.4-ka event is characterized by a massive and rapid (100% in ~100 years) drop in Δ14C (20) (Fig. 2B, arrow y). Multiple Δ14C measurements within the lifetime of each of four individual corals from two different seamounts clearly define this trend. The decrease is much faster than in situ decay of 14C and must be due to mixing-in of low Δ14C SSW. A Δ14C decrease is also seen at 2500 m, but with a lesser amplitude (~40%). We interpret this change as a 14C-depleted front spreading northward, rather than a shoaling of deeper water, because the Δ14C is lower at 2000 m than at 2500 m. This increase in the volume of I/D SSW at the expense of I/C-rich SSW formation at the 15.4-ka event is the likely cause of the Δ14C plateau in the atmosphere.

At the end of the 15.4-ka event, the water column has an “inverted” profile with radiocarbon-poor water overlaying radiocarbon-rich water (Figs. 2B and 4A). This inverted profile is analogous to GEOSECS profiles farther south in the modern west Atlantic, although the gradients are much smaller in the modern ocean. De-glacial intermediate SSW masses have previously been observed in benthic Δ14C records at lower latitudes in the Tasman Sea and at the Chatham Rise (45, 46), but this is the first time that water with such low Δ14C is seen at I/D depths so far north. Bolling-Allerød to Holocene. The Bolling begins at ~14.6 ka on the Greenland Ice Sheet Project 2 (GISP2) time scale (2, 47) and is widely recorded across the Northern Hemisphere (Fig. 1). Cd/Ca ratios (6) and Nd isotopes (49), from the North and South Atlantic, respectively, show that NSW dominated the deep Atlantic during the Bolling. The modeled and observed Δ14C records converge with one another at this time (Fig. 1, arrow d), suggesting that the Bolling ocean was capable of drawing down as much radiocarbon as the modern carbon cycle. Consistent with this suggestion, we observe that the Δ14C depth profile is more like the modern ocean than at any time since the glacial (49) (Fig. 4B). The entire water column is filled by radiocarbon-rich water, with deep water (3500 m) only 70% lower than the atmosphere (Fig. 4B). Radiocarbon-rich water also invaded the eastern Atlantic at this time (50). The timing of this NSW flush is consistent with the reinvigoration of export from the North Atlantic as recorded by Pa/Th (44).

Conclusions. The deep-ocean radiocarbon pattern supports the notion of the bipolar seesaw: When the deep ocean was flushed by radiocarbon-rich NSW, Greenland was warming, and when NSW was replaced by SSW, Greenland was cooling. The I/D ocean is much more variable, with multiple switches between radiocarbon-depleted and radiocarbon-enriched water masses (Fig. 3). These I/D-ocean radiocarbon events are associated with small climate changes observed in both Greenland and Antarctic ice cores. Increasing Δ14C in the I/D ocean is associated either with no temperature change or with warming. Decreasing I/D ocean Δ14C is associated with interruptions in the rise of temperature out of the LGM. This pattern is inconsistent with a bipolar seesaw link between cross-equatorial heat flux and climate change. I/D water-mass variability does not have as large an effect on climate as deep-ocean variability but may play an important role in modulating the atmospheric carbon reservoir.

References and Notes
8. D. diantius and D. cristagalli are two names for the same coral; the former is more widely used.
9. Δ14C/C ratios are reported as Δ14C, the ratio of a sample to the preindustrial modern atmospheric standard in units of %.
26. All corals in this study were collected in May 2003 using the deep submergence vehicle Alvin, ensuring that the depth of each coral (between 1100 and 2500 m) was well known; the corals were collected at, or near, life position. The Seamount locations are Muir, 33°30’S, 62°30’W; Manning, ~38°0’S, 60°30’W; and Gregg 39°0’N, 61°0’W.
27. Materials and methods are available as supporting material on Science Online.
37. After its initial production, 14C is attached to aerosols and removed from the atmosphere with a 1- to 2-year residence time. Because this process is completely different from the 14C removal mechanism, variations in the ratio of wet and dry deposition at Greenland could lead to 14C accumulation rate changes that are not correlated with cosmic ray-induced production rate changes. We do not consider this possible source of error in our analysis.
Postseismic Mantle Relaxation in the Central Nevada Seismic Belt
Noel Gourmelen* and Falk Amelung

Holocene acceleration of deformation and postseismic relaxation are two hypotheses to explain the present-day deformation in the Central Nevada Seismic Belt (CNSB). Discriminating between these two mechanisms is critical for understanding the dynamics and seismic potential of the Basin and Range province. Interferometric synthetic aperture radar detected a broad area of uplift (2 to 3 millimeters per year) that can be explained by postseismic mantle relaxation after a sequence of large crustal earthquakes from 1915 to 1954. The results lead to a broad agreement between geodetic and geologic strain indicators and support a model of a rigid Basin and Range between the CNSB and the Wasatch fault.

Some of the largest earthquakes in North America during the 20th century were located in the Central Nevada Seismic Belt (CNSB), one of the known actively deforming areas in the Basin and Range (Fig. 1). The 1915 Pleasant Valley earthquake [seismic magnitude \(M_s\) 7.2 to 7.6], the 1932 Cedar Mountain earthquake \(M_s\) 7.2), and the 1954 Rainbow Mountain–Fairview Peak–Wasatch Range earthquake sequence (four events, \(M_s\) 6.8 to 7.2, in a 6-month period) were right lateral to normal slip events, and ruptured a noncontinuous stretch of north-northeast striking range front faults ~250 km in length.

The present-day deformation across the CNSB is puzzling for two reasons: (i) The deformation rate during Holocene time is believed to be 0.5 to 1.3 mm/year (1–4), which is lower than the 2 to 4 mm/year measured by Global Positioning System (GPS) data (5–7); and (ii) GPS measurements reveal a zone of east-west contraction east of the CNSB (5–9) that is difficult to reconcile with current geodynamic models of the region, which involve east-west extension and right-lateral shear. One possible explanation for these two discrepancies is that the GPS data record not only the long-term deformation, but also transient deformation associated with viscous or viscoelastic relaxation of the lower crust or upper mantle after the last century’s earthquakes (7, 8, 10). We used 8 years of interferometric synthetic aperture radar (InSAR) data to investigate ongoing deformation in the CNSB.

The SAR imagery covers a swath nearly 700 km long (seven conventional SAR frames) acquired by the European Remote Sensing Satellites ERS-1 and ERS-2 between 1992 and 2000 to investigate crustal deformation at the CNSB (11). InSAR measurements in the radar line-of-sight (LOS) distance between the satellite and the surface of Earth; it is most sensitive to vertical movement and somewhat sensitive to east-west movements (12). A ground velocity map in LOS direction is shown in Fig. 1. The map was obtained by averaging (stacking) eight independent long-term interferograms, each spanning 4 to 7 years (Table 1). Most of the interferograms have perpendicular baselines smaller than 100 m. We used these pairs because larger baselines lead to decorrelation of the interferometric phase. We obtained the velocity map by dividing the cumulative LOS displacement of the interferograms by the cumulative interferogram period of 37 years. We assumed that uncertainties associated with the satellite orbits cause linear phase ramps across the interferogram and removed any linear trend from the data.

The resulting ground velocity map shows a bulge with LOS velocity as high as ~3 mm/ year of relative motion with respect to the margin of the interferograms, centered in the epicentral area of the 1915 Pleasant Valley and 1954 Dixie Valley earthquakes. About 1 to 2 mm/year is detected in the areas of Fairview Peak and Cedar Mountain earthquakes. The map also shows an area of subsidence in the northern part of the interferogram in the area of the Lone Tree gold mine, presumably caused by groundwater pumping in support of open-pit mining operations.

To test whether the observed phase signature is real deformation or a processing artifact, we generated another stack using eight interferograms covering shorter time periods (each <4 months, total time span ~2 years). Because no deformation is expected from such a stack, a residual signal would reveal processing, atmospheric, or orbital artifacts. To obtain comparable LOS velocities, we divided the cumulative LOS displacement of the short-term stack by the cumulative time of the long-term stack (37 years). The averaged LOS velocities based on the long-term stack (Fig. 2) show a long-wavelength signal of ~3 mm/year of LOS velocity, but the short-term stack does not show this signal. This result indicates that the

Reported online 13 May 2005; published online 3 November 2005; 10.1126/science.1114832
Include this information when citing this paper.